

James G. Clynes
Chairman

Latha Thompson
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com - Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8
Manhattan Community Board 8
Landmarks Committee
New York Blood Center
310 East 67th Street
September 19, 2016
6:30PM

Present: Elizabeth Ashby, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo, Sarah Chu, Alida Camp, Gayle Barron, Michele Birnbaum, Susan Evans

Public Member: Christina Davis

Absent excused: David Liston, Public Member Christina Davis

1. **172-174 East 73rd Street (between Lexington and 3rd Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District** – *Andrew W. Wright, architect; Adam Taubman, Valerie Campbell, Kramer Levin. NB: Li Saltzman Architects prepared the existing conditions report.* Application is for enlargement of 3rd floor, addition of a 4th floor and a rooftop bulkhead. Application for a report pursuant to Section 74-711 of the Zoning Resolution.

[Section 74-711 Special Permit –the City Planning Commission may permit modification of the use and bulk regulations provided that the application includes a report from the Landmarks Preservation Commission stating that a program has been established for a continuing maintenance program that will result in the preservation of the building. Any application shall include a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Landmarks Preservation Commission stating that the bulk modifications relate harmoniously to the subject landmark building.]

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO THREE PARTS FOR VOTING PURPOSES. See below.

WHEREAS 172-174 East 73rd Street is a Romanesque Revival style carriage house designed by Frank Wennemer and constructed in 1889.

WHEREAS 172-174 East 73rd Street is a 3-story carriage house designated an Individual Landmark in 1980 and is one of several carriage houses along the block that have individual designations.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes an expansion of the existing 3rd floor, the addition of a 4th floor and the addition of a rooftop bulkhead.

WHEREAS the existing rear elevation is set back 6' from the property line and is non-compliant within the existing zoning.

WHEREAS a special permit (Section 74-711) is required to waive the rear yard requirement and to waive the minimum distance for/and between the legally required windows that face the rear yard.

WHEREAS the applicant, as part of the Section 74-711 special permit, has agreed to a program for continuing maintenance and a restrictive declaration will be filed against the property.

WHEREAS as part of the continuing maintenance program, the applicant has agreed to a complete restoration of 172-174 East 73rd Street, including restorative work at the front elevation.

WHEREAS at the 3rd floor, the applicant proposes a build out of the existing 3rd floor that would add 1,405 square feet so that the 3rd floor would now be 25' wide x 60' long.

WHEREAS the new 4th floor would add an additional 1,655 sq. ft. to the house and measure 25' x 66'; the height of the 4th floor would be 10'7". [The existing height of the carriage house is 38'10" to the top of the cornice.]

WHEREAS the bulkhead above add another 393 sq. ft. to the building; the bulkhead which extends across width of the house, is set back 30' from the front elevation and 56' from rear elevation.

WHEREAS the existing cornice at the 3rd floor visually blocks 3 ½ feet of the new 4th floor front elevation.

WHEREAS the new 4th floor and the new bulkhead are not visible from the public way; the 4th floor is set back 15' from the front elevation.

WHEREAS the restoration of the existing carriage house has a preservation purpose including, at the front elevation, restoring the now-painted limestone at the ground level, replacing all the windows with in-kind wood windows and repairing and matching damaged bluestone at the base.

WHEREAS at the rear, the applicant is removing an existing 6' x 10' addition that extended to the rear lot line and creating 2 new windows at the new rear ground floor elevation where the addition formerly stood.

WHEREAS at the rear, at the new 3rd floor buildout, as well as at the new 4th floor, there will be new windows, French doors and terraces.

WHEREAS at the rear, the applicant proposes the mimic the arched tops of the existing windows for the new wooden windows and to reincorporate the sawtooth brick corbelling at the top of the 3rd and 2nd floors at the new masonry walltops.

WHEREAS at the 4th floor, the applicant proposes a light stucco finish that would present a "fading away" quality to the addition.

WHEREAS the stucco finish at the new 4th floor and at the bulkhead present as inexpensive; the stucco finish does not fit in with the character of the rest of the house which is brick.

WHEREAS the 3rd floor buildout, the addition of the 4th floor and the bulkhead add too much bulk to existing carriage house and are not contextual both for an individual landmark of this stature and within the historic district and would alter the historic character of the entire block.

PART A.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part A of this application – the buildout at the 3rd floor, the addition of a 4th floor and the rooftop bulkhead -- is disapproved as presented

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron, Camp)

PART B – The restoration of the existing carriage house based on the existing conditions report by Li Saltzman Architects.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part B of this application – the restoration of the existing carriage house and the continuing maintenance program going forward is approved as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron, Camp)

PART C - That the requirements for the Section 74-711 Special Permit have been met.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron, Camp)

2. **827 Madison Avenue-(East 68th and East 69th Streets)-Upper East Side Historic District-** Queen Anne style residence designed by Lamb & Wheeler and constructed in 1880-81. Application for the renovation of existing storefront.

WHEREAS the current storefront has no definable style and no historic material;
WHEREAS the current storefront has a dark aspect due to the use of dark materials;
WHEREAS the current store has a two story high space in the front corner;
WHEREAS the storefront windows are expressed vertically to reflect the two story high space;
WHEREAS the second floor of the store will be extended into the corner to create two floors throughout the store;
WHEREAS the new storefront windows will have spandrel panels that reflect the two floors;
WHEREAS the stone cladding for the new façade will be light in color;
WHEREAS the new storefront openings will have clear glass;
WHEREAS the new storefront openings will be framed with a double marble surround, the outer marble having a dark color and the inner marble having a light color;
WHEREAS the window frames and spandrels will be of statuary bronze;
WHEREAS the storefront on Madison Avenue will have a single storefront opening providing an uninterrupted view into the store;
WHEREAS the entrance to the store will be discretely located in the second opening to the east of Madison Avenue;
WHEREAS the entrance will have a bronze marquee that will extend about eight feet from the face of the wall and taper to a thin edge;
WHEREAS the spandrel panels create a horizontal proportioning of the storefront openings which is similar to the proportioning of adjacent and nearby stores on Madison Avenue;
WHEREAS the proposed storefront design is contextual and appropriate with the historic district;
THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

3. **605 Park Avenue (between 64th and 65th Streets) - Upper East Side Historic District.** *Tiffani Simple, architect.* Application for window, balcony enclosure and balcony railing master plans and replacement of entrance canopy.

WHEREAS 605 Park Avenue is a no-style contributing building within the Upper East Side Historic District designed. Y Sylvan Bien and constructed in 1953-54.
WHEREAS the applicant proposes a balcony enclosure master plan, a window replacement master plan, an entrance canopy replacement and a balcony railing replacement master plan.
WHEREAS for the balcony enclosure master plan, the applicant proposes aluminum framed balcony enclosures with fixed windows at the front and 2 casement windows on the sides.[Building terraces are included within balcony master plan.]
WHEREAS for the railing replacement master plan, the applicant proposes that all railing replacement match the bottom portion of the currently approved balcony enclosures. [New railings will match approved enclosures in configuration, material and finish until balcony is enclosed at a later date.]
WHEREAS for the window replacement master plan, the applicant proposes fixed and casement aluminum framed windows to replace the existing double hung windows. The applicant proposes to change all the building's windows at the same time; there are now 4 different types of windows.
WHEREAS although the applicant proposes to install new windows in every apartment at the same time, balcony replacement will be at the discretion of the apartment owner.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a metal clad canopy to replace the existing canvas canopy; the metal clad canopy will present as "lighter".

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to keep the existing brass posts that support the entrance canopy.

WHEREAS proposed changes for the balconies, the railings, the windows and the entrance canopy are improvements both to the "look" of Sylvan Bien's no-style building and to the surrounding streetscape.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron), 1 opposed (Camp)

4. **117 East 64th Street-(between Park and Lexington Avenues)-Upper East Side Historic District-Rick Azar, architect**-Neo-Grec residence designed by John McCool and constructed in 1876-77. Application for rooftop bulkhead.

WHEREAS the front and rear facades will be repaired and restored;

WHEREAS modern storm windows in the front will be removed and the existing windows replaced in kind;

WHEREAS the iron fence and iron railings will be repaired and restored;

WHEREAS the mix of windows in the rear will be replaced with multi-pane windows that are more in keeping with the style of the house;

WHEREAS a new stair and elevator bulkhead and new railings will be built on the roof;

WHEREAS the bulkhead will be of zinc and the railings of steel;

WHEREAS new air conditioning equipment will be screened

WHEREAS the chimneys in the rear on the western side of the house will be abandoned and capped as they would be too close to the new bulkhead;

WHEREAS new chimneys will be built in the rear on the eastern side of the house;

WHEREAS the new bulkhead and chimneys cannot be seen except very minimally from Park Avenue and from a garage entrance on East 65th Street;

WHEREAS the proposed restoration and new bulkhead are contextual and appropriate with the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

5. **812 Fifth Avenue (between 62nd and 63rd Streets) – Upper East Side Historic District – Nick Butterini, Designer.** Application is for the installation of two mirrors at the penthouse terrace.

WHEREAS 812 Fifth Avenue is a "No Style" non-contributing apartment building designed by Robert Bien and constructed in 1961.

WHEREAS the applicant would like to install/add two mirrors to the side parts/side walls of exterior terrace space on the 18th floor of a 2-story penthouse; the 2 terraces are on the lower level of the 5th Avenue facing penthouse.

WHEREAS the spaces on the two terraces are narrow; the applicant would like to add the mirrors so that the views can be enjoyed without going outside.

WHEREAS the mirrors would measure 7'6" high from the terrace paving and approximately 6'2" high from the parapet; the mirrors would be 42" wide.

WHEREAS the mirrors would present as windows and would be dark gray with a metallic silver metal frame to match the existing window frames.

WHEREAS the mirrors are removable.

WHEREAS the mirrors would catch the sun-- especially the mirror on the south terrace wall— there are inherent dangers/hazards presented by the reflections that would bounce off the mirrors.

WHEREAS the mirrors are visible from approximately 300' into Central Park.

WHEREAS existing windows on the various elevations of the penthouse provide the same views out as would the mirrors; thus the mirrors would duplicate the views already provided by the windows.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Camp, Baron)

6. **157 East 78th Street-(between Lexington and Third Avenues)-Individual Landmark-Eric Hammarberg, architect**-Italianate style row house designed by Henry Armstrong and constructed in 1861. Application for chimney modification.

WHEREAS 157 East 78th Street is a four story townhouse;

WHEREAS a new a 170 foot high building was erected adjacent to and on the west side of 157 East 78th Street, approximately 120 feet taller than the house;

WHEREAS two north chimneys on the west side in the rear are still in use;

WHEREAS the two chimneys are not visible from across the street but are visible from the rear yard;

WHEREAS the chimneys must either be extended above the top of the new building or shifted 15 feet to the east of the new building;

WHEREAS if the existing chimneys were extended next to and above the new building, the velocity of the air from the induced draft due to the height would change the air pressures inside and outside the house – and thereby change the environment within the house;

WHEREAS the owner proposes to angle the chimneys up at 45 degrees and to terminate them 15 feet to the east of the new building;

WHEREAS the owner will also angle the chimneys towards the rear of the house to minimize the visibility of the chimneys;

WHEREAS the tops of the relocated chimneys will be 22 feet above the rear of the house and about 20 feet above the front of the house due to the slope of the roof to the rear;

WHEREAS the relocated chimneys will be round, stainless steel, insulated flues;

WHEREAS the proposed chimneys will not be visible from across the street but will be visible from the rear yard;

WHEREAS the architect stated that he would specify that the flues have a matt finish instead of a polished finish to minimize the possibility of reflected sunlight;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall)
1 abstention (Tamayo)

7. **15 East 84th Street (between 5th and Madison Avenues – Upper East Side Historic District. Robert Goldrich, Leon Levy Foundation.** Application to install two window banners.

WHEREAS 15 East 84th Street is an Italian Renaissance style house designed by Renwick, Aspinwall & Owen and constructed in 1899.

WHEREAS 15 East 84th Street is owned by the Leon Levy Foundation and currently houses the Institute for the Study of the Ancient World, a part of New York University.

WHEREAS the applicant sponsors exhibitions from time to time which are advertised through banners fixed to the two windows on either side of the entry door; the exhibitions have a short time frame.

WHEREAS the applicant is now planning an exhibition that is much longer than usual; the banners that will be used to advertise the show will be installed for a timeframe that goes beyond the timeframe that the Landmarks Commission allows for the installation of banners; because of this, a Certificate of Appropriateness is required for the banners. The banners will be installed for approximately 9 months.

WHEREAS the banners will be 91” tall x 52 ½” wide and will be made of vinyl canvas and attached to the front of the windows with plastic ties and will be blue and white.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Tamayo, Baron, Camp), 1 opposed (Parshall)