

Alida Camp
Chair



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, NY 10022
(212) 758-4340

Will Brightbill
District Manager

(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail
www.cb8m.com – Website

The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, May 13, 2019 – 6:30PM
Marymount Manhattan College, Regina Peruggi Room
221 East 71st Street (between 2nd and 3rd Avenues)

Please note: The resolutions contained in the committee minutes are recommendations submitted by the committee chair to the Community Board. At the monthly full board meeting, the resolutions are discussed and voted upon by all members of Community Board 8 Manhattan.

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within an Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, May 15, 2019, at the New York Blood Center, Auditorium (310 East 67th Street) at 6:30PM**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

Minutes

Resolutions for Approval:

Items 1 (Part A), 2-4: Unanimous

Resolutions for Disapproval:

Item 1 (Part B): Unanimous

1. **146 East 65th Street (between 3rd and Lexington Avenues) – Expanded Upper East Side Historic District** *John Woell, Steven Harris Architects LLP*. Application is for the addition of a rear-yard greenhouse at the rear lot line. [NOTE: At our November Landmarks Committee meeting, we approved the applicant’s proposal for work at the front and rear elevations; the application was subsequently approved at the Landmarks Preservation Commission.]

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS: Part A - The proposed greenhouse and Part B - the proposed planter to contain American holly trees to be placed behind the greenhouse.

PART A - The Proposed Greenhouse

WHEREAS 146 East 65th Street is a Colonial revival-style single house designed by Treanor & Fatio and built in 1924;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a greenhouse for the garden to be built 10’8” from the rear lot line;

WHEREAS the proposed greenhouse will measure 9’ wide by 32’ long x 12’6” high; the cladding will match the cladding of the house — red brick;

WHEREAS the wood cornice for the greenhouse will match exactly the cornice at the street elevation at the first floor and will be the same height as the top of the garden wall at 12’6”;

WHEREAS the proposed greenhouse will have a set of steel and glass greenhouse doors that will face the five 5’ wide set of steel and glass doors at the basement level of the rear elevation of the house. There are 5 doors in each set;

WHEREAS the 10’8” space between the rear lot line and the proposed greenhouse will allow for the construction of a planter along the length of the greenhouse;

WHEREAS the planter will not sit on the ground but will present as a planting well that will have the same exact height as the rear garden wall and will sit 9’ above the ground and be approximately 3 feet deep;

WHEREAS the top of the planter will be the same height as the existing height of the garden wall at 12’6” high;

WHEREAS there is a void between the ground level of the rear yard and the planter 9’ above the ground;

WHEREAS the design and the materials to be used for the greenhouse match and compliment the Treanor and Fatio design for the Colonial-revival style house;

WHEREAS the proposed greenhouse is contextual and appropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT Part A of this application, the proposed greenhouse, be **approved** as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Cohn, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo, Dangoor)
ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Kimberly Selway

PART B - The Proposed Planter containing American holly trees

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a planter to be placed in the space between the rear lot line and the greenhouse;

WHEREAS the top of the planter will be the same height as the greenhouse and garden wall at 12'6" high and will extend along the 27' length of the greenhouse;

WHEREAS the planter will be planted with 15' high American holly trees; the American holly trees will present as if planted at the rear wall of the greenhouse off the roof;

WHEREAS the overall height of the planter plus the planted American holly trees will be 27'9": 15' (trees) plus the approximately 3' in depth planter which will be constructed 9' from the ground level;

WHEREAS the proposed planted trees will present as a high 15' wall at the top of the 12'6" garden wall at the rear lot line;

WHEREAS the height from the ground level to the top of the American holly trees is almost 30' — with the 15' densely planted American holly trees, the very high screen that is created at the rear lot line, while an imaginative solution to screen out the surrounding properties, is out-of-context and inappropriate within the historic district;

WHEREAS to clarify, the garden wall is 12'6" high, the greenhouse is 12'6" high, the top of the horizontal planter is positioned so that the top line of the planter is at the exact same height of both the greenhouse and the garden wall; the depth of the planter which will be set along the rear roof of the greenhouse is approximately 3'. This is where the line of American holly trees will be planted — they will be planted in the 3' high planter. The planter itself sits 9' off the ground so that there is a 9' void between the bottom of the planter and the rear yard.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part B, the proposed planter containing American holly trees, be **disapproved** as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Dangoor)
ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Kimberly Selway

2. **910 Fifth Avenue (between East 72nd and East 73rd Streets) – Upper East Side Historic District** *Stewart Ackerman, Panorama Windows LTD.* Application is for the replacement of windows.

WHEREAS 910 Fifth Avenue is an undistinguished building with a modernist façade that dates from 1958-59;

WHEREAS 910 Fifth Avenue has a master plan for windows that has been approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission;

WHEREAS the applicant seeks to replace the windows for apartment 11C on the west and south facades;

WHEREAS the proposed windows will be of grey colored aluminum and will be consistent with the building's approved master plan for windows;

WHEREAS the windows will be replaced in three masonry openings in the west façade and one masonry opening at the corner in the south façade;

WHEREAS the northernmost masonry opening in the west facade has a masonry pier that will be removed;

WHEREAS the existing windows in the west façade will be replaced with the following numbers of evenly spaced combinations of casement and fixed windows: five in the northern masonry opening, four in the middle masonry opening, and five in the southern masonry opening at the corner;

WHEREAS the existing windows in the south façade in the western masonry opening at the corner will be replaced with five equally spaced combinations of casement and fixed windows;

WHEREAS the proposed windows will match the numbers and proportions of windows in the masonry openings of the apartment above;

WHEREAS the proposed windows contribute to bringing visual order to the building in accordance with the master plan for windows;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Dangoor)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Kimberly Selway

3. **1045 Fifth Avenue (between East 85th and East 86th Streets) – Metropolitan Museum Historic District** *Juergen Riehm, 1100 Architect*. Application is for work at the penthouse, including installing new doors and windows.

WHEREAS 1045 Fifth Avenue is a “no-style, non-contributing” building in the historic district;

WHEREAS the front façade has white brick masonry walls on the sides with horizontal bands of floors set between the masonry walls;

WHEREAS the primary materials of each floor on the front façade are bronze colored aluminum and bronze tinted glazing;

WHEREAS the applicant seeks to enlarge the penthouse apartment by 644 square feet;

WHEREAS the 14th floor will remain unchanged in area;

WHEREAS the 15th floor will be enlarged by 104 square feet in areas at the perimeter to match the floor plate size of the 14th floor;

WHEREAS the Penthouse will be enlarged to the east and south by 540 square feet;

WHEREAS there is existing white brick masonry on all facades;

WHEREAS there is existing dark brown brick masonry on the west façade of the bulkhead;

WHEREAS new masonry will match existing masonry in color;

WHEREAS the frames for windows and glass doors will have a statuary bronze finish to match the existing;

WHEREAS the glazing for the windows and the glass door system will have a bronze tint to match the existing;

WHEREAS the changes in the massing are minimal and the proposed enlargement replicates the materials and character of the existing building;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Dangoor)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Kimberly Selway

4. **National Society of Colonial Dames in the State of New York, 215-217 East 71st Street (between Second and Third Avenues) – Proposed Individual Landmark.**

Sarah Kalimatos presenting for Friends of the Upper East Side Historic Districts; Sarah Hewitt presenting as a member of the Colonial Dames in the State of New York Board of Governors. Clint Allen, Property Manager for 215-217 East 71st Street. [NOTE: The Friends of the Upper East Side Historic Districts initiated the Request for Evaluation for the house. They were supported by the Colonial Dames at every step in the process. The RFE requested Landmarks Designation for the interior; however, this part of the RFE has been withdrawn at the request of the Colonial Dames.]

WHEREAS 215-217 East 71st Street is a neo-classical house designed by Richard Henry Dana, Jr. and completed in 1930;

WHEREAS the architect based his design, meant to reflect the National Society of Colonial Dames in the State of New York’s colonial ties, on the Colonel John McCever house, a 1750 structure that once stood on Wall Street;

WHEREAS the design was also influenced by the architect’s extensive knowledge of English and Dutch colonial architecture;

WHEREAS the resulting house resulted in a “Georgian reproduction so perfect that only its date of construction demands the ‘neo’ prefix to the style”. (Quote from “Daytonian in Manhattan,” Friday, August 4, 2017);

WHEREAS Richard Henry Dana, Jr. was a member of a distinguished American family: his mother was the former Edith Longfellow, daughter of the famous New England piper and a grandson of Richard Harry Dana, Jr., the author of *Two Years Before the Mast*;

WHEREAS Richard Henry Dana, Jr. is identified with a number of notable public buildings including the Dalton School on East 89th Street;

WHEREAS 215-217 East 71st Street is adjacent to John Russell Pope’s Junior League Club of New York (now Marymount Manhattan College); the Colonial Dames site was purchased the year after the Junior League purchase;

WHEREAS 215-217 East 71st Street deserves an INDIVIDUAL LANDMARK designation.

WHEREAS its contribution to our streetscape is especially noteworthy because of its architectural significance and because it provides a glimpse into the evolution of early 20th century architecture in our great city;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan supports INDIVIDUAL LANDMARK designation for the Headquarters of the Society of Colonial Dames in the State of New York.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Dangoor)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Kimberly Selway

5. Old Business

6. New Business

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs